Impossibility of Full Decentralization in Permissionless Blockchains

Yujin Kwon, Jian Liu, Minjung Kim, Dawn Song, Yongdae Kim 05.15.2019

Traditional currencies





Traditional currencies





Global financial crisis 2008







Bitcoin



Blockchain

Bitcoin is the first decentralized digital currency. To this end, it relies on a blockchain technology.



Bitcoin



Bitcoin is the first decentralized digital currency. To this end, it relies on a blockchain technology.



Drawbacks of the Bitcoin system



Transaction scalability









Drawbacks of the Bitcoin system





Bitcoin was supposed to be decentralized, but it didn't end up this way. And

never will. Proof-of-Work is dead.



By Egor Homakov







Proof of stake & Delegated proof of stake

PoS

Main concern: Rich becomes richer.



DPoS

It forgoes full decentralization. Instead, make power of rich nodes equal.





Why is decentralization important?

✤ If the attacker possesses over 33% or 50% power, the deviating behavior would significantly affect other nodes.

Unfair transaction validation

Unusual transaction fees



Currently.....

No Incentive? Algorand Blockchain Sparks Debate at Cryptography Event

"Incentives are the hardest thing to do" -MIT Micali





Currently.....

We cannot be certain whether the proposed designs can indeed achieve good decentralization.

In addition, there are only few works to analyze existing cryptocurrencies yet except for the work of analyzing Bitcoin and Ethereum.



Our paper

✤ We study when the full decentralization is possible.

- ✤ We analyze PoW, PoS, and DPoS systems in TOP 100 coins.
 - Protocol analysis
 - Data analysis



System model

- ✤ Players should possess resource power α_{p_i} to participate in a consensus protocol.
- However, if delegation of their resources or running multiple nodes are more profitable, they do this.
- Players consider their payoff as an **expected net profit** U_{n_i} .
- Players increase their resources by investing a part of earned net profits.



(m, ε, δ) – decentralization

The number of **players running nodes** in a consensus protocol is greater than or equal to *m*.

✤ The ratio between effective power of the richest and δ – th percentile is less than or equal to 1 + ϵ (i.e., even power distribution).



(m, ε, δ) – decentralization

The number of **players running nodes** in a consensus protocol is greater than or equal to *m*.

✤ The ratio between effective power of the richest and δ – th percentile (i.e., even power distribution).

Then how can we reach (m,ε,δ) -decentralization?



First requirement

- At least *m* nodes with any resource power can earn a net profit.
- It is not more profitable to delegate their resources to others than the case that players run nodes by themselves.





Second requirement

- ✤ It is not more profitable for one player above the δ th percentile to run multiple nodes.
- ✤ The resource power ratio between the richest and δ th nodes converges in probability to 1.





Sufficient conditions

- ✤ 1) At least *m* nodes with any resource power can earn a net profit.
- ✤ 2) It is not more profitable to delegate their resources to others than the case that players run nodes by themselves.
- ✤ 3) It is not more profitable for one player above the δth percentile to run multiple nodes.
- ♦ 4) The resource power ratio between the richest and δth nodes converges in probability to 1.



Make the system reach (m, ε, δ) – decentralization with probability 1



Can we find an incentive system satisfying these conditions?

Consider the following incentive system where nodes can earn the net profit in proportion to a square root of their resource power.

A net profit
$$R_{n_i} = \begin{cases} B_r & \text{if } n_i \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases}$$
,
Probability for node n_i pr $(R_{n_i} | \alpha) = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{if } R_{n_i} = B_r \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{else} \end{cases}$,

The expected net profit
$$U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \alpha_{-n_i}) = \frac{B_r \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}}$$



Can we find an incentive system satisfying these conditions?

Condition 3?

Condition 4?

2?

A net profit
$$R_{n_i} = \begin{cases} B_r & \text{if } n_i \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases}$$
,
Probability for node n_i pr $(R_{n_i} | \alpha) = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{if } R_{n_i} = B_r \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{else} \end{cases}$,

The expected net profit
$$U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \alpha_{-n_i}) = \frac{B_r \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}}.$$



Can we find an incentive system satisfying these conditions?

Condition 1? V

Condition 2?

Condition 3?

Condition 4?

A net profit $R_{n_i} = \begin{cases} B_r & \text{if } n_i \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases}$, Probability for node n_i pr $(R_{n_i} | \alpha) = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{if } R_{n_i} = B_r \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{else} \end{cases}$,

The expected net profit
$$U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \alpha_{-n_i}) = \frac{B_r \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}}$$



Can we find an incentive system satisfying these conditions?

Condition 1?

Condition 3?

Condition 4?

Condition 2? \checkmark

A net profit
$$R_{n_i} = \begin{cases} B_r & \text{if } n_i \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases}$$
,
Probability for node n_i pr $(R_{n_i} | \alpha) = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{if } R_{n_i} = B_r \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{else} \end{cases}$,

The expected net profit
$$U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \alpha_{-n_i}) = \frac{B_r \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}}.$$



Can we find an incentive system satisfying these conditions?

Condition 1? V

Condition 3?



A net profit
$$R_{n_i} = \begin{cases} B_r & \text{if } n_i \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases}$$
,
Probability for node n_i to get the net profit $\Pr(R_{n_i} | \alpha) = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{if } R_{n_i} = B_r \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{else} \end{cases}$,

The expected net profit
$$U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \alpha_{-n_i}) = \frac{B_r \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}}$$



Can we find an incentive system satisfying these conditions?

Condition 2? V Condition 4? V

Condition 1? V

Condition 3? V

When existing identity management

A net profit
$$R_{n_i} = \begin{cases} B_r & \text{if } n_i \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases}$$
,
Probability for node n_i pr $(R_{n_i} | \alpha) = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{if } R_{n_i} = B_r \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{else} \end{cases}$,

The expected net profit
$$U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \alpha_{-n_i}) = \frac{B_r \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}}$$



Permissionless blockchains

- Anyone who is even anonymous should be able to join in the system.
 - These blockchains do not have any identity management.
- Many cryptocurrencies are based on permissionless blockchains.
- Many people want to design which by their nature.





























It can be possible for poor nodes to get larger net profits than that for rich nodes with **some probability**.

$$U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \boldsymbol{\alpha}_{-\boldsymbol{n_i}}) = F\left(\sum_{n_i \in \mathcal{N}} \alpha_{n_i}\right) \cdot \alpha_{n_i},$$



What is probability to reach full decentralization?

* The probability to reach full decentralization is upper bounded by a ratio between resource power of the $\delta - th$ percentile and richest in the system.



The gap between the richest and poorest in the real world





The gap between the richest and poorest in the real world













To reduce this gap, for any two nodes, a system distributes rewards larger than the power ratio to a node with smaller power. Meanwhile, the other node with larger power receives the reward less than the power ratio.

$$R_{n_i} = \begin{cases} B_r & \text{if } n_i \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases},$$
$$\Pr(R_{n_i} | \alpha) = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{if } R_{n_i} = B_r \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{else} \end{cases},$$

$$U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \alpha_{-n_i}) = \frac{B_r \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}}$$







To reduce this gap, for any two nodes, a system distributes rewards larger than the power ratio to a node with smaller power. Meanwhile, the other node with larger power receives the reward less than the power ratio.



$$\begin{split} R_{n_i} &= \begin{cases} B_r & \text{if } n_i \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases}, \\ \Pr(R_{n_i} | \alpha) &= \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{if } R_{n_i} = B_r \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{else} \end{cases}, \\ U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \alpha_{-n_i}) &= \frac{B_r \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}}. \end{split}$$



To prevent this behavior, construct the incentive system as a decreasing function of the number of nodes.

e.g., B_r is a decreasing function of the number of nodes.

Rich nodes can run multiple nodes for a higher profit

for a higher profit

To reduce this gap, for any two nodes, a system distributes rewards larger than the power ratio to a node with smaller power. Meanwhile, the other node with larger power receives the reward less than the power ratio.

$$R_{n_{i}} = \begin{cases} B_{r} & \text{if } n_{i} \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases},$$

$$\Pr(R_{n_{i}}|\alpha) = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_{i}}}}{\sum_{n_{j} \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_{j}}}} & \text{if } R_{n_{i}} = B_{r} \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_{i}}}}{\sum_{n_{j} \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_{j}}}} & \text{else} \end{cases},$$

$$U_{n_{i}}(\alpha_{n_{i}}, \alpha_{-n_{i}}) = \frac{B_{r} \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_{i}}}}{\sum_{n_{i} \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_{j}}}}.$$



To prevent this behavior, construct the incentive system as a decreasing function of the number of nodes.



This leads for multiple players to cooperate by combining into few nodes.

e.g., B_r is a decreasing function of the number of nodes.



Rich nodes can run multiple nodes for a higher profit



$$R_{n_i} = \begin{cases} B_r & \text{if } n_i \text{ generates a block} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases},$$

$$\Pr(R_{n_i} | \alpha) = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{if } R_{n_i} = B_r \\ 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}} & \text{else} \end{cases},$$

$$U_{n_i}(\alpha_{n_i}, \alpha_{-n_i}) = \frac{B_r \cdot \sqrt{\alpha_{n_i}}}{\sum_{n_j \in \mathcal{N}} \sqrt{\alpha_{n_j}}}.$$



To prevent this behavior, construct the incentive system as a decreasing function of the number of nodes.

e.g., B_r is a decreasing function of the number of nodes.





Rich nodes can run multiple nodes for a higher profit



As a result, four conditions are contradictory in permissionless blockchains.



Analysis of protocols for TOP 100 coins

Table II								
CLASSIFICATION OF TOP 100 COINS (SEP.	11, 2018)							

Consensus	Coins	Count
Proof of Work	 Bitcoin (1) [1], Ethereum (2) [6], Bitcoin Cash (4) [19], Litecoin (7) [20], Monero (9) [21], Dash (10) [22], Ethereum Classic (13) [23], Dogecoin (18) [24], Zcash (19) [25], Bytecoin (21) [26], Bitcoin Gold (22) [27], Decred (25) [28], Bitcoin Diamond (26) [29], DigiByte (28) [30], Siacoin (33) [31], Verge (34) [32], Metaverse ETP (35) [33], Bytom (36) [34], Komodo (39) [35], MOAC (43) [36], Horizen (47) [37], MonaCoin (51) [38], Bitcoin Private (52) [39], ZCoin (56) [40], Syscoin (60) [41], Electroneum (61) [42], Groestlcoin (64) [43], Bitcoin Interest (67) [44], Ravencoin (71) [45], Vertcoin (70) [46], Namecoin (72) [47], BridgeCoin (74) [48], SmartCash (75) [49], Ubiq (77) [50], DigitalNote (82) [51], ZClassic (83) [52], Burst (85) [53], Primecoin (86) [54], Litecoin Cash (90) [55], Unobtanium (91) [56], Electra (92) [57], Pura (96) [58], Viacoin (97) [59], Bitcore (100) [60] 	44
Proof of Stake	Cardano (8) [61], Qtum (24) [62], Waves (31) [63], Stratis (37) [64], Cryptonex (38) [65], Ardor (42) [66], Wanchain (44) [67], Nxt (50) [68], PIVX (57) [69], Factom (62) [70], PRIZM (63) [71], WhiteCoin (76) [72], Blocknet (79) [73], Particl (80) [74], Neblio (81) [75], BitBay (87) [76], Global Currency Reserve (89) [77], NIX (93) [78], SaluS (94) [79], LEOcoin (98) [80], ION (99) [81]	22
Delegated Proof of Stake	EOS (5) [82], TRON (12) [83], Tezos (15) [84], Lisk (20) [85], BitShare (27) [86], Steem (32) [87], GXChain (48) [88], Ark (49) [89], WaykiChain (68) [90], Achain (84) [91], Asch (88) [92], Steem Dollars (95) [87]	12
Others	Stellar (6) [93], NEO (14) [94], NEM (16) [95], ICON (30) [96], ReddCoin (40) [97], Hshare (41) [98], Nebulas (53) [99], Emercoin (54) [100], Elastos (55) [101], Nexus (58) [102], Skycoin (69) [103], Nexty (66) [104], Peercoin (73) [105]	13
DAG	IOTA (11) [106], Nano (29) [107], Byteball Bytes (59) [108]	3
Permission	XRP (3) [109], VeChain (17) [110], Ontology (23) [111], GoChain (65) [112]	5
Token	Huobi Token (45)	1
Not working	BitcoinDark (46), Boscoin (78)	2



Analysis of protocols for TOP 100 coins

Table II								
CLASSIFICATION O	OF TOP	100 coins	(Sep.	11,	2018)			

Consensus	Coins	Count
Proof of Work	 Bitcoin (1) [1], Ethereum (2) [6], Bitcoin Cash (4) [19], Litecoin (7) [20], Monero (9) [21], Dash (10) [22], Ethereum Classic (13) [23], Dogecoin (18) [24], Zcash (19) [25], Bytecoin (21) [26], Bitcoin Gold (22) [27], Decred (25) [28], Bitcoin Diamond (26) [29], DigiByte (28) [30], Siacoin (33) [31], Verge (34) [32], Metaverse ETP (35) [33], Bytom (36) [34], Komodo (39) [35], MOAC (43) [36], Horizen (47) [37], MonaCoin (51) [38], Bitcoin Private (52) [39], ZCoin (56) [40], Syscoin (60) [41], Electroneum (61) [42], Groestlcoin (64) [43], Bitcoin Interest (67) [44], Ravencoin (71) [45], Vertcoin (70) [46], Namecoin (72) [47], BridgeCoin (74) [48], SmartCash (75) [49], Ubiq (77) [50], DigitalNote (82) [51], ZClassic (83) [52], Burst (85) [53], Primecoin (86) [54], Litecoin Cash (90) [55], Unobtanium (91) [56], Electra (92) [57], Pura (96) [58], Viacoin (97) [59], Bitcore (100) [60] 	44
Proof of Stake	Cardano (8) [61], Qtum (24) [62], Waves (31) [63], Stratis (37) [64], Cryptonex (38) [65], Ardor (42) [66], Wanchain (44) [67], Nxt (50) [68], PIVX (57) [69], Factom (62) [70], PRIZM (63) [71], WhiteCoin (76) [72], Blocknet (79) [73], Particl (80) [74], Neblio (81) [75], BitBay (87) [76], Global Currency Reserve (89) [77], NIX (93) [78], SaluS (94) [79], LEOcoin (98) [80], ION (99) [81]	22
Delegated Proof of Stake	EOS (5) [82], TRON (12) [83], Tezos (15) [84], Lisk (20) [85], BitShare (27) [86], Steem (32) [87], GXChain (48) [88], Ark (49) [89], WaykiChain (68) [90], Achain (84) [91], Asch (88) [92], Steem Dollars (95) [87]	12
Others	Stellar (6) [93], NEO (14) [94], NEM (16) [95], ICON (30) [96], ReddCoin (40) [97], Hshare (41) [98], Nebulas (53) [99], Emercoin (54) [100], Elastos (55) [101], Nexus (58) [102], Skycoin (69) [103], Nexty (66) [104], Peercoin (73) [105]	13
DAG	IOTA (11) [106], Nano (29) [107], Byteball Bytes (59) [108]	3
Permission	XRP (3) [109], VeChain (17) [110], Ontology (23) [111], GoChain (65) [112]	5
Token	Huobi Token (45)	1
Not working	BitcoinDark (46), Boscoin (78)	2







Enter your hash rate (MH/s)	0.25			Network HashRate (GH/s)	241,548.33	ľ
Power Consumption (in Watts)	13			Average Block Time (Secs)	13.9	ľ
Cost per kW/h (\$)	0.10			Price of 1 Ether (USD)	\$211.31	ſ
Currency BTC ETH ETC XMR ZEC	PASC DASH LTO	DCR				
B	PROFIT RATIO P	er day	PROFIT PER MONTH		Calculate	Reset
Calculated for						
1 BTC = \$ 6,460.76	Profit per day \$ -0.03 Pool Fee \$ 0	Mined/day B 9e-12	Power cost/Da \$ 0.03120			
Hashing Power	Profit per week	Mined/week	Power cost/Wee	Power Cost	Profit	
Power consumption (w)	\$ -0.2 Pool Fee \$ 0	₿ 6e-11	\$ 0.2184	\$0.0013	-(\$0.0011)	
13 Month	rofit per month \$ -0.9	Mined/month B 3e-10	Power cost/Mont \$ 0.936(\$0.0312	-(\$0.0271)	
Cost per KWh (\$)	Pool Fee \$ 0				(
0.1 Year	Profit per year \$ -11.39 Pool Fee \$ 0	Mined/year B 3e-9	Power cost/Yea \$ 11.39	\$0.2184	-(\$0.1899)	
Pool Fee (%)				\$0.9360	-(\$0.8137)	







As a result, we expect that there are not sufficiently many independent players and biased power distribution in PoW coins.



PoS coins



This result is similar to PoW coins.



DPoS coins



Rich nodes have the same power. If no identity management, rich players would run multiple nodes.



EOS Identity management

A public website URL At least one social media account ID on Steemit Tech specs Scaling plan

What are the criteria for being an EOS Block Producer?

Anyone can announce candidacy to be a Block Producer. <u>EOSGO</u>—an independent and community-based organization that is a self-proclaimed bridge between Block.one and EOS community/token holders has outlined it's own 8 criteria below which have been commonly accepted by the

#	Account	Location	Votes %	Votes	URL	a Block Producer.
1	<u>eoshuobipool</u>		2.271%	111,684,769	http://eoshuobipool.com	least one social media
2	<u>eoslaomaocom</u>	Japan	2.164%	106,416,369	https://eoslaomao.com	
3	bitfinexeos1		2.069%	101,779,825	https://www.bitfinex.com	ation, all posted to the
4	eosnewyorkio	Cook Islands	2.006%	98,655,236	https://bp.eosnewyork.io	
5	eosliquideos	Israel	1.937%	95,256,100	http://vote.liquideos.com	
6	<u>eosauthority</u>	United Kingdom	1.901%	93,501,480	https://eosauthority.com	

.

Analysis on protocols

ANALYSIS OF INCENTIVE SYSTEMS											
Coin name Con 1 Con 2 Con 3 Con 4 N _{dpos} Sybil cost											
PoW & PoS coins											
All PoW&PoS†	0	0	•	0	—	×					
BridgeCoin	0	0	•	•	-	×					
		DPo	S coins								
EOS	0	0	0*	0	21						
TRON	0	0	0*	0	27						
Lisk	0	0	0	0	101	×					
BitShare	0	0	0	0	27	×					
Steem	0	0	0*	0	20						
GXChain	0	0	0	0	21	×					
Ark	0	0	0	0	51	×					
WaykiChain	0	0	0	0	11	×					
Achain	0	0	0	0	99	×					
Asch	0	0	0	0	91	×					
Steem Dollars	0	0	0*	0	20						

Table I

 $\dagger = \text{except for BridgeCoin}; \bullet = \text{fully satisfies the condition}; \bullet = \text{partially satisfies the condition}; \circ = \text{not satisfy the condition}; \blacktriangle = \text{has imperfect Sybil costs}; X = \text{not have Sybil costs};$



- Collect the addresses of block generators for PoW, PoS, and DPoS coins in TOP 100 coins.
- In the process, we considered past 10,000 blocks for PoW and PoS systems and considered past 100,000 blocks for DPoS systems.
- ✤ Metirc
 - The number of addresses
 - Gini (This metric ranges between 0 and 1)
 - Entropy



Table II POW COINS

	100 %			50%		33%			
Coin name	$ \mathcal{A} $	Gini	Н	$ \mathcal{A}^{\frac{1}{2}} $	Gini ¹ /2	$H^{\frac{1}{2}}$	A3	Gini	$H^{\frac{1}{3}}$
Bitcoin	62	0.8192	3.89	4	0.1143	1.98	3	0.1103	1.57
Ethereum	65	0.8634	3.38	3	0.1402	1.53	2	0.0415	1.00
Bitcoin Cash	15	0.5729	3.06	3	0.2572	1.51	2	0.0859	0.12
Litecoin	35	0.8094	3.10	3	0.0176	1.58	2	0.0146	1.00
Dash	109	0.9005	3.79	4	0.2050	1.90	2	0.0770	0.98
Ethereum Classic	83	0.8916	3.17	2	0.1538	0.93	1	0	0
Dogecoin	400	0.8686	4.95	4	0.2123	1.89	2	0.1098	0.96
Zcash	75	0.8932	3.36	3	0.0615	1.52	2	0.0546	0.15
Bitcoin Gold	29	0.8585	2.36	1	0	0	1	0	0
Decred	17	0.7751	2.33	2	0.1471	0.35	2	0.1471	0.35
Bitcoin Diamond	16	0.7401	2.44	2	0.0707	0.99	2	0.0707	0.99
DigiByte	125	0.7791	5.09	7	0.2724	2.63	4	0.1879	1.90
Siacoin	1406	0.8582	3.02	2	0.1551	0.98	2	0.1551	0.98
Verge	82	0.7261	4.92	8	0.1762	3.03	5	0.0820	2.46
Metaverse ETP	36	0.7964	3.25	3	0.2914	1.49	2	0.1927	0.97
Bytom	12	0.7978	1.54	1	0	0	1	0	0
MOAC	28	0.7067	3.46	3	0.2330	1.53	2	0.1615	0.98
Horizen	96	0.9109	3.39	3	0.0882	1.56	2	0.0189	1.00
MonaCoin	44	0.8185	3.39	3	0.1373	1.56	2	0.0920	0.99
Bitcoin Private	135	0.8557	4.48	5	0.1260	2.28	3	0.0766	1.57
Zcoin	361	0.9562	1.75	1	0	0	1	0	0
Syscoin	5979	0.2529	10.37	1978	0.5055	6.78	644	0.7571	3.61
Groestlcoin	10	0.4969	2.67	3	0.3408	1.47	2	0.4110	0.45
Bitcoin Interest	19	0.7267	2.66	2	0.3109	0.70	1	0	0
Vertcoin	60	0.8390	3.61	3	0.2639	1.40	2	0.2064	0.87
Ravencoin	71	0.8014	4.12	4	0.2057	1.90	2	0.0488	0.99
Namecoin	3390	0.5693	8.00	49	0.8613	2.52	3	0.1913	1.48
BridgeCoin		0	0	1	0	0	1	0	0
SmartCash	7	0.6885	1.47	1	0	0	1	0	0
Ubig	34	0.8440	2.58	1	0	0	1	0	0
Zclassic	41	0.7762	3.54	3	0.2394	1.43	2	0.0899	0.98
Burst	143	0.9054	3.45	2	0.2473	0.82	1	0	0
Prime	7477	0.2525	10.46	2476	0.5048	6.63	809	0.7565	3.22
Litecoin Cash	33	0.6788	3.78	5	0.0711	2.31	3	0.0557	1.58
Unobtanium	30	0.9463	0.89	1	0	0	1	0	0
Electra	1268	0.6608	8.34	46	0.5262	4.87	12	0.2622	3.53
Pura	19	0.6521	3.08	3	0.0778	1.58	2	0.0905	0.99
Viacoin	33	0.9141	1.78	1	0	0	1	0	0
Bitcore	116	0.9337	3.11	2	0.0956	0.97	2	0.0956	0.97

Tab	le III
PoS	COINS

		100 %			50%		33%		
Coin name	$ \mathcal{A} $	Gini	Н	$ \mathcal{A}^{\frac{1}{2}} $	Gini ¹ / ₂	$H^{\frac{1}{2}}$	A3	Gini 3	H
Cardano	7	0.0039	2.81	3	0.0083	2.11	2	0.0111	1.50
Tezos	245	0.8391	5.54	9	0.1061	3.13	6	0.1168	2.55
Qtum	1853	0.7404	8.07	32	0.5923	4.12	7	0.2512	2.69
Waves	110	0.8606	4.24	4	0.1545	1.93	3	0.1628	1.51
Stratis	527	0.8113	6.78	20	0.2626	4.15	10	0.2007	3.23
Cryptonex	122	0.9231	3.30	4	0.0103	2.00	3	0.0078	1.58
Ardor	247	0.8623	4.91	8	0.5376	2.20	6	0.4554	1.95
Nxt	165	0.9150	3.30	2	0.0326	1.00	2	0.0326	1.00
PRIZM	82	0.8672	3.68	4	0.0053	2.00	3	0.0022	1.58
Whitecoin	239	0.6273	6.84	32	0.2954	4.75	15	0.2740	3.71
Blocknet	584	0.7965	6.54	10	0.3891	2.96	4	0.1778	1.92
Particl	1801	0.5989	9.48	141	0.4436	6.56	48	0.3713	5.21
Neblio	1177	0.8258	6.00	5	0.4523	1.74	2	0.3123	0.70
Bitbay	313	0.7839	6.02	9	0.3075	2.94	4	0.0890	1.97
GCR	263	0.8192	5.84	11	0.2515	3.43	6	0.1779	2.68
NIX	1130	0.4520	9.62	255	0.2224	7.86	135	0.2180	6.96
SaluS	27	0.6974	3.41	4	0.1577	1.97	3	0.1342	1.56
Leocoin	879	0.5988	8.72	106	0.3639	6.33	44	0.3268	5.16
ION	287	0.8998	4.24	2	0.0335	1.00	2	0.0335	1.00

Table IV DPOS COINS

	100 %				50%		33%			
Coin name	$ \mathcal{A} $	Gini	Η	$ \mathcal{A}^{\frac{1}{2}} $	Gini ¹ / ₂	$H^{\frac{1}{2}}$	$ \mathcal{A}^{\frac{1}{3}} $	Gini ¹ / ₃	$H^{\frac{1}{3}}$	
EOS	22	0.0447	4.43	11	0.0002	3.46	7	0.0003	2.81	
TRON	28	0.0358	4.79	14	0.0009	3.81	9	0.0008	3.17	
Lisk	101	0.0023	6.66	51	0.0011	5.67	34	0.0010	5.09	
BitShare	27	0.0009	4.75	14	0.0007	3.81	9	0.0003	3.17	
Steem	140	0.8324	4.68	-11	0.0002	3.46	7	0.0002	2.81	
GXChain	21	0.0328	4.39	10	0.0016	3.32	7	0.0013	2.81	
Ark	52	0.0200	5.69	25	0.0005	4.64	16	0.0003	4.00	
WaykiChain	11	0.1688	3.27	5	0.0021	2.32	4	0.0022	2.00	
Achain	99	0.0018	6.63	49	0.0009	5.61	32	0.0008	5.00	
Asch	92	0.0769	6.50	42	0.0267	5.39	27	0.0184	4.75	



Table II POW COINS

		100 %	1		50%		-	33%	- 1
Coin name	$ \mathcal{A} $	Gini	Н	$ \mathcal{A}^{\frac{1}{2}} $	Gini ¹ / ₂	$H^{\frac{1}{2}}$	A3	Gini 3	$H^{\frac{1}{3}}$
Bitcoin	62	0.8192	3.89	4	0.1143	1.98	3	0.1103	1.57
Ethereum	65	0.8634	3.38	3	0.1402	1.53	2	0.0415	1.00
Bitcoin Cash	15	0.5729	3.06	3	0.2572	1.51	2	0.0859	0.12
Litecoin	35	0.8094	3.10	3	0.0176	1.58	2	0.0146	1.00
Dash	109	0.9005	3.79	4	0.2050	1.90	2	0.0770	0.98
Ethereum Classic	83	0.8916	3.17	2	0.1538	0.93	1	0	0
Dogecoin	400	0.8686	4.95	4	0.2123	1.89	2	0.1098	0.96
Zcash	75	0.8932	3.36	3	0.0615	1.52	2	0.0546	0.15
Bitcoin Gold	29	0.8585	2.36	1	0	0	1	0	0
Decred	17	0.7751	2.33	2	0.1471	0.35	2	0.1471	0.35
Bitcoin Diamond	16	0.7401	2.44	2	0.0707	0.99	2	0.0707	0.99
DigiByte	125	0.7791	5.09	7	0.2724	2.63	4	0.1879	1.90
Siacoin	1406	0.8582	3.02	2	0.1551	0.98	2	0.1551	0.98
Verge	82	0.7261	4.92	8	0.1762	3.03	5	0.0820	2.46
Metaverse ETP	36	0.7964	3.25	3	0.2914	1.49	2	0.1927	0.97
Bytom	12	0.7978	1.54	1	0	0	1	0	0
OAC	28	0.7067	5.46	3	0.222	53	2	0.1615	.98
prizen	96	0.9109	20	3	0 \$82	1.56	2	0 0189	1.00
Minteror	4	0.8 85	.39	3	0 373	6	2	0.0 20	.99
Bitc n Pri te	13	0 57	4.48	5	0. 50	8	3	0.0 56	.57
Zcoin	361	0, 62	1.75	1	0	0	1	0	0
Syscoin	5979	0.2529	10.37	1978	0.5055	6.78	644	0.7571	3.61
Groestlcoin	10	0.4969	2.67	3	0.3408	1.47	2	0.4110	0.45
Bitcoin Interest	19	0.7267	2.66	2	0.3109	0.70	1	0	0
Vertcoin	60	0.8390	3.61	3	0.2639	1.40	2	0.2064	0.87
Ravencoin	71	0.8014	4.12	4	0.2057	1.90	2	0.0488	0.99
Namecoin	3390	0.5693	8.00	49	0.8613	2.52	3	0.1913	1.48
BridgeCoin	1	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	0
SmartCash	7	0.6885	1.47	1	0	0	1	0	0
Ubiq	34	0.8440	2.58	1	0	0	1	0	0
Zclassic	41	0.7762	3.54	3	0.2394	1.43	2	0.0899	0.98
Burst	143	0.9054	3.45	2	0.2473	0.82	1	0	0
Prime	7477	0.2525	10.46	2476	0.5048	6.63	809	0.7565	3.22
Litecoin Cash	33	0.6788	3.78	5	0.0711	2.31	3	0.0557	1.58
Unobtanium	30	0.9463	0.89	1	0	0	1	0	0
Electra	1268	0.6608	8.34	46	0.5262	4.87	12	0.2622	3.53
Pura	19	0.6521	3.08	3	0.0778	1.58	2	0.0905	0.99
Viacoin	33	0.9141	1.78	1	0	0	1	0	0
Ditcore	116	0.9337	3.11	2	0.0956	0.97	2	0.0956	0.97

Table III	
POS COINS	

		100 %			50%		33%					
Coin name	$ \mathcal{A} $	Gini	Н	$ \mathcal{A}^{\frac{1}{2}} $	Gini ¹ / ₂	$H^{\frac{1}{2}}$	A3	Gini ³	H			
Cardano	7	0.0039	2.81	3	0.0083	2.11	2	0.0111	1.50			
Tezos	245	0.8391	5.54	9	0.1061	3.13	6	0.1168	2.5			
Qtum	1853	0.7404	8.07	32	0.5923	4.12	7	0.2512	2.6			
Waves	110	0.8606	4.24	4	0.1545	1.93	3	0.1628	1.5			
Stratis	527	0.8113	6.78	20	0.2626	4.15	10	0.2007	3.2			
Cryptonex	122	0.9231	3.30	4	0.0103	2.00	3	0.0078	1.5			
Ardor	247	0.8623	4.91	8	0.5376	2.20	6	0.4554	1.9			
Nxt	165	0.9150	3.30	2	0.0326	1.00	2	0.0326	1.0			
PRE	2	0.8672	3.68	4	0.0057	2.00	- 3	0.0022	1.5			
White	59).(13	84	3.	0.295	4.7	1	174	3			
Bloc et	84	0. 55	54	10	0.389.	96	4	177	1			
Particl	1801	0.5989	48	141	0.4436	6.30	48	0.3713	5.2			
Neblio	1177	0.82.20	6.00	5	0.4523	1.74	2	0.3123	0.7			
Bitbay	313	0.7839	6.02	9	0.3075	2.94	4	0.0890	1.9			
GCR	263	0.8192	5.84	11	0.2515	3.43	6	0.1779	2.6			
NIX	1130	0.4520	9.62	255	0.2224	7.86	135	0.2180	6.9			
SaluS	27	0.6974	3.41	4	0.1577	1.97	3	0.1342	1.5			
Leocoin	879	0.5988	8.72	106	0.3639	6.33	44	0.3268	5.10			
ION	287	0.8998	4.24	2	0.0335	1.00	2	0.0335	1.0			

Table IV DPOS COINS

		100 %			50%		33%						
Coin name	$ \mathcal{A} $	Gini	Н	$ \mathcal{A}^{\frac{1}{2}} $	Gini ¹ / ₂	$H^{\frac{1}{2}}$	$ A^{\frac{1}{3}} $	Gini ¹ /3	$H^{\frac{1}{3}}$				
EOS	22	0.0447	4.43	11	0.0002	3.46	7	0.0003	2.81				
TRON	28	0.0358	4.79	14	0.0009	3.81	9	0.0008	3.17				
Lisk	101	0.0023	6.66	51	0.0011	5.67	34	0.0010	5.09				
BitShare	27	0.0009	4.75	14	0.000		9	0.0003	5.17				
Steem	140		.6		0.00 2	3.46		a. 12	.81				
GXChai	21	0.03 8			0.00	3.3		0.00	.81				
Ark	2	0	59	-25	0.0005	1.00	.5	0.0003	00				
WaykiChain	11	0.1688	3.27	5	0.0021	2.32	4	0.0022	2.00				
Achain	99	0.0018	6.63	49	0.0009	5.61	32	0.0008	5.00				
Asch	92	0.0769	6.50	42	0.0267	5.39	27	0.0184	4.75				



Table II POW COINS									Table III POS COINS										
		100 %		[50%		<u> </u>	33%	_		_	100 0	r	USCO	JINS EOU		1 10/2		
Coin name	14	Gini	н	1421	Gini	HZ	1431	Gini	H			100 %	_		50%			35%	-
Bitagin	62	0 9102	2.90	1000-1	0 11/2	11.09	2	10 1103	11.57	Coin name	A	Gini	H	$ \mathcal{A}^{\frac{1}{2}} $	Gini ²	H ²	$ A^{\hat{3}} $	Gini ³	H3
Ethorouro	65	0.8192	2.89	4	0.1145	1.98	3	0.1105	1.57	- ino	7	1.0039	2.81	3	0.0083	11	2	0.0111	1.50
Bitcoin Cash	15	0.5729	3	3	0.1402	51		0.0415	1.00	Teros	- 15	0.8301	5.54		0 <1	12	6	0.1168	2.55
Litecoin	35	0.8094	3 1		01 16	th i		0.0037	100		1853	17 11	1 177	32	0.1 23	12	7	0.2512	2.69
Dash	109	0.0004	3 3		0. 50			0.0770	0.9	W	110	18 16	4.24	4	0 45	93	X /	0.1628	1.51
Ethereum Classic	83	0.8916	3.17	2	0.1510	10.93		0		Stratis	527	0.8113	6 78	20	0.2626	4 15		0.2007	3 23
Dogecoin	400	0.8686	4.95	4	0.2123	1.89	2	0.1098	0.96	Cryptoney	122	0.0115	3 30	4	0.2020	2.00	3	0.2007	1.58
Zcash	75	0.8932	3.36	3	0.0615	1.52	2	0.0546	0.15	Cryptonex	247	0.9231	4.01	-	0.0103	2.00	5	0.0078	1.05
Bitcoin Gold	29	0.858	2.36	1	0	0	1	0	0	Ardor	147	0.0025	4.91	0	0.3370	2.20	0	02074	1.95
Decred	17	0.775	2.33	2	0,1471	0.25	2	0.1471	0.35	NXI	10.	0.9130	5.50	- 2	0.0526	1.00	2	.0526	1.00
Bitcoin Diamond	16	0.740	2.44		070	1.99	2	.0.0 17	0.99		82	2		4	10053	1			1.58
DigiByte	125	0.779	5 0		272	2.63	4	0.1879	1.90	hitebin	139	0.6. 3	-	3.	0.2954	· 15		.2740	3.71
Siacoin	1406	0.858	3.0		.1551		2	51	0.98	loc et	58-			1	0.3891	2.	4	.1778	1.92
Verge	82	0.7261	4.92	8	0.1762	NOTIFY .	5	0.0820	2.46	Particl	1801	0.5989	9.48	141	0.4436	6.56	48	0.3713	5.21
Metaverse ETP	36	0.7964	3.25	3	0.2914	1.49	2	0.1927	0.97	Neblio	1177	0.8258	6.00	5	0.4523	1.74	2	0.3123	0.70
Bytom	12	0.7978	1.54	1	0	0	1	0		Bitbay	313	0.7839	6.02	9	0.3075	2.94	4	0.0890	1.97
MOAC	28	0.7067	3.46	3	0.2330	1.53	2	0.1615	0 8	GCR	263	0.8192	5.84	11	0.2515	3.43	6	0.1779	2.68
Horizen	96	0.9109	3.39	3	0.0882	1.56	- 2	0.	0		1 0	10/ 40	67	255	0.2224	7.86	135	0.2180	6.96
MonaCoin	44	0.8185	3.39	3	0.1373	1.56	-	0. 20	9	1 MARCH 10 MARCH	-27	1 14	141		0.1577	197	3	0.1342	1.56
Bitcoin Private	135	0.8557	4.48	5	0.1260	2.28	$\mathbb{Z}_{\mathbb{Z}}$	0.	7		-	150	7	-	0 3630	633	44	0 3268	5.16
Zcoin	361	0.9562	1.75	1	0	0	1	0	0	Loon	207	0.3900	4.34	100	0.0033	1.00		0.0225	1.00
Syscoin	5979	0.2529	10.37	1978	0.5055	6.78	644	0.7571	3.61	ION	201	0.8998	4.24	4	0.0555	1.00	- 4	0.0555	1.00
Groestlcoin	10	0.4969	2.67	3	0.3408	1.47	2	0.4110	0.45										
Bitcoin Interest	19	0.7267	2.66	2	0.3109	0.70	1	0	0					Table	IV				
Vertcoin	60	0.8390	3.61	3	0.2639	1.40	2	0.2064	0.87				D	PoS C	OINS				
Ravencoin	71	0.8014	4.12	4	0.2057	1.90	2	0.0488	0.99		T	100 %			50%			33%	
Namecoin	3390	0.5693	8.00	49	0.8613	2.52	3	0.1913	1.48		1.41	00 10		1 1 1	0010	111	1 1 1	000	11
BridgeCoin	1	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	0	Coin name	$ \mathcal{A} $	Gini	н	$ \mathcal{A}^{\vec{2}} $	Gini 2	HZ	$ \mathcal{A}^{\vec{3}} $	Gini 3	H3
SmartCash	7	0.6885	1.47	1	0	0	1	0	0	EOS	22	0.0447	4.43	11	0.0002	3.46	7	0.0003	2.81
Ubiq	34	0.8440	2.58	1	0	0	1	0	0	TRON	28	0.0358	4.79	14	0.0009	3.81	9	0.0008	3.17
Zelassic	41	0.7762	3.54	3	0.2394	1.43	-	0.0899	0.98	Lisk		0.0023	6.0		0.0011	5.67	34	0.0010	5.09
Burst	143	0.9054	3.45	2	0.2473	0.82	1	0	0		2	IV and	4	14	0.0007	3.81	9	0.0003	3 17
Prime	1477	0.2525	10,46	2476	0.5048	0.63	ditte.	1 65	E Y	Steem	40	832/	1.68		0.0007	3.46	1	0.0002	2.81
Litecoin Cash	33	0.6788	3.78	5	0.0711	2.31	3	0. 57		- Contraction	140		4		0.0002	2.20	7	0.0002	2.01
Unobtanium	30	0.9463	0.89	1	0	0	10	0 2622	0	GAChai	21	0.	4	-0	0.0016	3.32	/	0.0013	2.81
Electra	1208	0.6608	8.54	40	0.5262	4.87	12	0.2622	3.33	Ark	52	0.0200	5.69	25	0.0005	4.64	16	0.0003	4.00
Pura	19	0.6521	3.08	3	0.0778	1.58	2	0.0905	0.99	WaykiChair	n 11	0.1688	3.27	5	0.0021	2.32	4	0.0022	2.00
Viacoin	35	0.9141	1./8	1	0	0	1	0	0	Achain	99	0.0018	6.63	49	0.0009	5.61	32	0.0008	5.00
Bitcore	116	0.9337	3.11	2	0.0956	0.97	2	0.0956	0.97	Asch	92	0.0769	6.50	42	0.0267	5.39	27	0.0184	4.75



Qtum staking pool



This funds then should be used for staking. Like a mining pool. Every user should be able to access only his funds and his share of the mined coins.

System Security

Thanks

Running multiple nodes in DPoS coins

* **GXChain**, Ark, and Asch

		nathan														opengate						
	ſ																					
	Votes	250,499,225.63	251,004,670.79	250,497,206.13	251,004,671.46	250,981,010.40	251,170,897.63	251,008,665.91	250,495,927.98	251,011,666.82	250,475,544.63	250,479,543.08	251,004,670.79	250,501,204.58	251,023,051.92	250,493,929.09	250,488,538.00	251,002,671.90	250,497,206.13	251,023,110.11	250,475,544.63	251,004,667.46
nesses	Confirmed	14379299	14379308	14379294	14379316	14379290	14379312	14379325	14379324	14379322	14379320	14379313	14379311	14379321	14379317	14379318	14379289	14379315	14379314	14379323	14379319	14379310
 Active Wit 	Witness	aaron	🛒 caitlin	🛄 kairos	🕄 sakura	承 taffy	miner1	🏟 miner2	iii miner3	miner4	🗰 miner5	miner6	🛱 miner7	🗐 miner8	🛱 miner9	👸 miner10	miner11	m hrrs	🏟 dennis1	david12	🛄 marks-lee	robin-green



Interesting debate



"Can you say anything about incentives in Algorand?"

"Incentives are the hardest thing to do"



Interesting debate



"Can you say anything about incentives in Algorand?"

"Incentives are the hardest thing to do"

YES! Our study proves this fact.

"We must use incentives as a last resort. I believe I can [make Algorand work without incentives], but I have no formal proof that I can, because these formal proofs are much harder than the proofs of Algorand."





Interesting debate

$$U_{n_i}=-c$$







New design of consensus protocols?

- Non-outsourceable puzzles
 - "If outsourced, member miners in the pool may be able to steal the rewards from the pool manager."
 - How about cloud mining?





New design of consensus protocols?

- Non-delegable/ non-divisible resources
 - Reputation?
 - Trust?

. . .



New design of consensus protocols?

- Non-delegable/ non-divisible resources
 - Reputation?
 - Trust?

However, these are related to identity.

So, these are not suitable for permissionless blockchains.



Direction to go & Open questions

We should give up permissionless blockchains with good decentralization.

We should find out a good way to assign Sybil costs in permissionless blockchains.



